

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Science Advisory Board
Committee: Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis (Council)
Health Effects Subcommittee (HES)
Public Teleconference

Summary Minutes of Public Teleconference
Date: August 8, 2003

Subcommittee Members: (See Roster - Attachment A.)

Date and Time: 11 a.m. to 12:30 pm, August 8, 2003 (See Federal Register Notice - Attachment B).

Location: By teleconference only

Purpose: The purpose of the call was to prepare for a public meeting of the Subcommittee planned for August 27-29 meeting of the Subcommittee.

Attendees: Chair: Dr. Bart Ostro, HES Members: Dr. Rebecca Parkin, Mr. John Fintan Hurley, Dr. Morton Lippmann; Chair of the Council, Dr. Trudy Cameron; Council Member, Ms. Lauraine Chestnut; Members of the Special Council Panel for the Review of the Third 812 Analysis, Drs. Dale Hattis and Thomas Wallsten.

SAB Staff: Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Official.

Other Persons Attending: From EPA: James DeMocker, Lisa Connor, Bryan Hubbell, Harvey Richmond, Mary Ross, Eric Ginsburg; EPA Contractors: Leland Deck, Abt Associates; Jim Neumann, IEc; Others: Margo Schwab, Office of Management and Budget, Barbara Warren, consultant to the Clean Air Task Force, Neil Shah, Inside Washington.

Meeting Summary:

The discussion generally followed the issues and timing as presented in the meeting Agenda (see Meeting Agenda - Attachment C). The teleconference lasted until 12:30 pm. There were no written comments submitted to the Committee, and there was no written request to present public comments during the discussion.

Welcome and Introductions - Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Official (DFO) opened the session at 11:00, took roll, and extended a welcome to the subcommittee from Dr. Vanessa Vu, Director of the SAB Staff Office, who was unable to participate. Dr. Bart Ostro, Chair, welcomed members of the subcommittee and Council Special Panel Members on the call. He reminded HES members that advisory teleconference and meeting discussions were on the record. He informed HES members of his request to the DFO that the Agency provide subcommittee members with the nonroad diesel analysis, since that document is referenced in the Agency's Analytical plan, which the GES and the Council were reviewing. He provided an update on his recent discussions with EPA and SAB DFO Staff regarding his concern that several charge questions were open ended and that they called on the HES and Council to play

"arbiter and decision maker" roles rather than perform the role of reviewer. He requested that EPA indicate more clearly "what it would like to do on charge questions 14-17" and maybe some others. He requested Subcommittee Members' reactions and their thoughts regarding revisions to the Agenda for the August 27-29 meeting. If there was no sufficient specificity from the Agency at the meeting and if the Agency indicated that it might prepare review material for more focused HES advice at a later date, potential options might include holding a shorter meeting on August 27-29, restructuring the agenda to include more briefings, or suggestion a workshop format for pursuing selected issues at a later date.

Orientation to Chapter 6 and Related Appendices

Mr. James DeMocker agrees that increased specificity a related to elements of charge questions 14-17 was appropriate. He informed the committee that the Agency currently plans to undertake the health effects assessment in calendar year 2004. The Agency is currently focusing on emissions inventory issues and scenario issues related to the implementation control case study. New schedule and emission inventory-related issues also have arisen because of the improvements in the CMAQ air quality model performance has improved. The Agency is considering using this integrated model, which runs on a common platform, open architecture platform, rather than, or in addition to REMSAD for PM and CAMX for ozone. These changes may delay air quality modeling past Thanksgiving and defer health effects modeling until mid to late winter.

Mr. DeMocker estimated that the final report would likely be completed in September 2004. Dr. Ostro briefly discussed options for HES advice with Dr. Cameron, Chair of the Council and the DFO. HES advice could be included in a Council report or issued as a separate report devoted to health effects, which the Council would review.

Mr. DeMocker stated that he would provide the DFO with hard copies of the non-diesel RIA for the HES members and also a web link to the material.

Discussion of Charge Questions for August 27-29 Meeting

Dr. Lippmann addressed Dr. Ostro's question concerning the open-ended nature of several Agency comments by providing a brief review of the Council's history giving the Agency early advice. Dr. Cameron then commented that the Council was comfortable with the notion of "ex-post" review. The DFO commented that Dr. Vu sees the Council's role as including "advice" as well as "review," but that the Agency could assist the HES in providing focused advice by providing information or analysis for members to discuss. Dr. Ostro gave the example of Charge Question 14a; it would be helpful if EPA contractors and staff gave the HES proposals for using/combining studies. In a response to a follow-up question from Dr. Lippmann, Mr. DeMocker explained that the Agency was considering an alternative analysis to past practices which relied on cohort studies (i.e., using long-term cohort studies as primary estimate, short term studies as an alternative estimate, and as a sensitivity analysis, examining different models from the cohort studies.) The charge question asked for review of this alternate methodology,

which is an approach reflected in recent EPA rulemakings, including the non road regulatory impact analysis.

Mr. Hurley endorsed "feeding in ideas before Agency makes plans," while recognizing that the HES may still review the plans and their outcome at a later date. If it is "not realistic" for the Agency to come with "strong ideas," the Agency can give "first ideas," and the HES give first comments. The Agency then would make decisions and the HES would give comments down the line. Dr. Parkin agreed with this view.

Other advisors on the call expressed their perspectives. Dr. Lippmann spoke of the broad knowledge base of experts on the HES, who may be able to reach consensus. Dr. Cameron suggested that the subcommittee be very clear and deliberate in communicating the parameters of the areas of consensus and the issues where they are not able to provide consensus advice.

Dr. Ostro then began a short discussion of the alternative analysis and whether it could be one data point within a broader uncertainty analysis and viewed in a more probabilistic setting. Dr. Hattis spoke of the merits of analyzing the data probabilistically. Dr. Lippmann spoke of the logic issues to be confronted and others discussed how to determine the appropriate use of time series and cohort series data.

Dr. Lippmann discussed the relevance of the meeting of the Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC) on August 25-26 to the work of the HES. Dr. Ostro requested that inform the HES about the results of the CASAC meeting at the HES meeting August 27-29.

Ms. Chestnut requested additional information regarding the relationship of the non road analysis to the 812 analysis. She asked if the non-road analysis was to be the baseline and whether that analysis explained life-expectancy loss. Mr. DeMocker responded that in large part, the non-road analysis was the working baseline or a starting point, but that, as Question 17 indicates, the Agency is contemplating departures, such as the degree of life shortening among people with COPD.

Dr. Ostro asked whether the charge questions reflected all departures from the RIA related to PM analysis. Mr. DeMocker was not clear on this point. Dr. Lippmann asked about the assumptions and rationale underlying the non-road analysis. Mr. DeMocker responded that the Agency made the decision that the alternative analysis should be included, that he was not able to respond to Dr. Lippmann's question fully, and that the alternative analysis had some limited data. Drs. Ostro and Lippmann discussed the need to address the issue of uncertainty scientifically and to the need to distinguish the issue of uncertainty from different assumptions. Dr. Lippmann requested more explanation of the validity of assumptions underlying the non-road rule analysis.

Dr. Ostro then addressed Question 15b concerning mathematical models of disease and requested EPA staff and contractors to provide a discussion of models for the Committee. Mr. Hurley suggested that an alternate lead discussant might be more appropriate for this question.

Dr. Ostro agreed to review assignments and follow-up by email with proposed changes.

Discussion of Draft Agenda for August 27-29 Meeting

Dr. Ostro summarized the sense of the HES that it would be helpful at the August 27-29 meeting for the Agency provide the HES with additional information about their plans for the health assessment analysis. Mr. DeMocker emphasized the difficulty of specifying methodologies and options in the time available before the meeting. Dr. Ostro committed to identifying requests for specific presentations from the Agency and also requested that EPA Staff and contractors be available to answer questions during the meeting.

Discussion of Roles and Responsibilities Before and at the August 27-29 Meeting

Dr. Nugent briefly reviewed the responsibilities of Subcommittee members to review Agency documents and come to the meeting prepared to discuss all charge questions. Lead discussants are to prepare a written draft response for discussion at the meeting and are to lead the Subcommittee discussion on their assigned charge questions. During the meeting or within one week after it, lead discussants are responsible for documenting the discussion on the charge questions. They are to identify both the areas of consensus, and, where there are a range of different views expressed. Dr. Ostro clarified that the first discussant listed on the assignment list was the lead discussant. Additional discussants listed are to prepare written materials on those questions and serve as back up for the lead discussant.

Dr. Lippmann pointed out that no discussant was assigned to Charge Question 17. Dr. Wallsten discussed sending his written material on Charge Question 28 to Dr. Hattis and Dr. Nugent, since he will be unable to attend the meeting.

Dr. Bryan Hubbell of EPA asked whether the HES would like a briefing outlining the improved capability of the Ben Map modeling system using air quality modeling. A few members of the Subcommittee stated that a brief presentation might be useful, and Dr. Ostro responded that he would work with the DFO to send Mr. DeMocker a list of the topics where presentations were most important.

Dr. Ostro then thanked Subcommittee Members. Mr. DeMocker also thanked the members for participating and for their future advice.

Action items:

1. Dr. Ostro and Dr. Nugent to revise the agenda for the August 27-29 meeting to provide time for Agency presentations on the charge questions on Day1 and an update from Dr. Morton Lippmann about the meeting of the CASAC Particulate Matter Review Panel on August 25-26. . Agency staff to be present to answer questions related to charge questions throughout the meeting.

2. Dr. Ostro and Dr. Nugent to identify areas where presentations from the Agency would be most helpful to the subcommittee
3. Mr. Jim DeMocker to provide Dr. Nugent with information about the nonroad diesel draft RIA for distribution to the members.
4. Dr. Ostro to enquire if Ms. Chestnut could be lead discussant on charge questions 15-a and 15-c
5. Dr. Ostro to follow up with Dr. Kinney and Dr. Kleinman regarding their assignments and any potential issues related to the August 27-29 meeting.
6. Dr. Ostro and Dr. Nugent to assign discussants to Charge Question 17 and clarify any other errata in the charge questions.
7. Dr. Wallsten to send comments to Dr. Hattis regarding Charge Question 28; Dr. Hattis will serve as lead discussant

At 1:30 p.m., Dr. Ostro adjourned the teleconference.

Respectfully Submitted:

/s/ Angela Nugent
Designated Federal Official

Certified as True:

Chair

/s/ Bart Ostro

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by the Council Subcommittee to the Agency during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect definitive consensus advice from the Council. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters, or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.

Attachment A
**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Science Advisory Board
Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis
Health Effects Subcommittee***

CHAIR

Dr. Bart Ostro, Chief, Air Pollution Epidemiology Unit, California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), Oakland, CA

OTHER SAB MEMBERS

Dr. Rebecca Parkin, Associate Research Professor, Environmental and Occupational Health, Public Health and Health Services, The George Washington University, Washington, DC
Member: Integrated Human Exposure Committee
Executive Committee

CONSULTANTS

Mr. John Fintan Hurley, Research Director, Institute of Occupational Medicine (IOM), Edinburgh, , UK

Dr. Patrick Kinney, Associate Professor, Department of Environmental Health Sciences, Mailman School of Public Health , Columbia University, New York, NY

Dr. Michael Kleinman, Professor, Department of Community and Environmental Medicine, College of Medicine, University of California, Irvine, CA

Dr. Nino Kuenzli, Professor, Department of Preventive Medicine, Keck School of Medicine, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA

Dr. Morton Lippmann, Professor, Nelson Institute of Environmental Medicine, New York University School of Medicine, Tuxedo, NY

SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF

Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Officer, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington, DC, Phone: 202-564-4562, Fax: 202-501-0323, (nugent.angela@epa.gov)

Attachment B
Federal Register Notice

Science Advisory Board Staff Office; Advisory Council on Clean Air
Compliance Analysis Health Effects Subcommittee; Notification of
Upcoming Public Teleconference and Meeting

[Federal Register: July 30, 2003 (Volume 68, Number 146)]

[Notices]

[Page 44766-44767]

From the Federal Register Online via GPO Access [wais.access.gpo.gov]

[DOCID:fr30jy03-53]

ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

[FRL-7536-5]

Science Advisory Board Staff Office; Advisory Council on Clean
Air Compliance Analysis Health Effects Subcommittee; Notification of
Upcoming Public Teleconference and Meeting

AGENCY: Environmental Protection Agency (EPA).

ACTION: Notice.

SUMMARY: The EPA Science Advisory Board Staff Office is announcing a
public teleconference and a public meeting of the Advisory Council on
Clean Air Compliance Analysis (Council) Health Effects Subcommittee
(HES).

DATES:

August 8, 2003. A public teleconference call meeting for the HES
will be held from 11 a.m. to 12:30 p.m. (eastern time).

August 27-29, 2003. A public meeting for the HES will be held from
9 a.m. on August 27, 2003 to 2:30 p.m. on August 29, 2003 (eastern
time).

ADDRESSES: Participation in the teleconference meeting will be by
teleconference only. The meeting location for the August 27-29, 2003,
meeting of the HES will be in Washington, DC. The meeting location will

be announced on the SAB Web site, <http://www.epa.gov/sab> two weeks before the meeting.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT: Members of the public who wish to obtain the call-in number and access code to participate in the teleconference meeting may contact Ms. Sandra Friedman, EPA Science Advisory Board Staff, at telephone/voice mail: (202) 564-2526; or via e-mail at friedman.sandra@epa.gov, or Ms. Delores Darden, EPA Science Advisory Board Staff at telephone/voice mail: (202) 564-2282; or via e-mail at darden.delores@epa.gov. Any member of the public wishing further information regarding the Council or the HES may contact Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), U.S. EPA Science Advisory Board (1400A), 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW., Washington, DC 20460; by telephone/voice mail at (202) 564-4562; or via e-mail at nugent.angela@epa.gov. General information about the SAB can be found in the SAB Web site at <http://www.epa.gov/sab>.

SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION:

Background. Pursuant to the Federal Advisory Committee Act, Public Law 92-463, Notice is given that the HES will hold a public teleconference, as described above, to prepare for the public meeting, also described above. The purpose of the public meeting is to advise the Agency on its plan to develop a health effects assessment for the third in a series of statutorily mandated comprehensive analyses of the total costs and benefits of programs implemented pursuant to the Clean Air Act.

Background on the Council, the HES, and on the advisory project was provided in a Federal Register notice published on February 14, 2003 (68 FR 7531-7534).

The HES will be providing advice, through the Council, on the review document, "Benefits and Costs of the Clean Air Act 1990-2020; Revised Analytical Plan for EPA's Second Prospective Analysis" currently found at the following Web site, maintained by EPA's Office of Air and Radiation at: <http://www.epa.gov/oar/sect812/> under the link "Study Blueprint and Charge Questions Electronic Copy." This link provides electronic access to the Revised Analytical Plan, the "change pages" given to the Council and HES in July 2003, and the detailed review charge questions.

Procedures for Providing Public Comment. It is the policy of the EPA Science Advisory Board (SAB) Staff Office to accept written public comments of any length, and to accommodate oral public comments whenever possible. The EPA SAB Staff Office expects that public statements presented at its meetings will not be repetitive of previously submitted oral or written statements. Oral Comments: In

general, each individual or group requesting an oral presentation at a face-to-face meeting will be limited to a total time of ten minutes (unless otherwise indicated). For conference call meetings, opportunities for oral comment will usually be limited to no more than three minutes per speaker and no more than fifteen minutes total. Interested parties should contact the Designated Federal Official (DFO) at least one week prior to the meeting in order to be placed on the public speaker list for the meeting. Speakers should bring at least 35 copies of their comments and presentation

[[Page 44767]]

slides for distribution to the participants and public at the meeting. Written Comments: Although written comments are accepted until the date of the meeting (unless otherwise stated), written comments should be received in the SAB Staff Office at least one week prior to the meeting date so that the comments may be made available to the committee for their consideration. Comments should be supplied to the DFO at the address/contact information noted above in the following formats: One hard copy with original signature, and one electronic copy via e-mail (acceptable file format: Adobe Acrobat, WordPerfect, Word, or Rich Text files (in IBM-PC/Windows 95/98 format). Those providing written comments and who attend the meeting are also asked to bring 35 copies of their comments for public distribution.

Meeting Accommodations: Individuals requiring special accommodation to access these meetings, should contact Dr. Nugent at least five business days prior to the meeting so that appropriate arrangements can be made.

Dated: July 22, 2003.
Vanessa T. Vu,
Director, EPA Science Advisory Board Staff Office.
[FR Doc. 03-19277 Filed 7-29-03; 8:45 am]
BILLING CODE 6560-50-P

Attachment C
Meeting Agenda
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Science Advisory Board
Advisory Council on Clean Air Act Compliance Analysis (Council)
Health Effects Subcommittee
Public Teleconference - August 8, 11:00-12:30 pm Eastern Time

11:00 -11:15	Opening of Teleconference. Remarks,	Dr. Angela Nugent, SAB Staff Dr. Vanessa Vu, SAB Staff
	Review of Agenda	Dr. Bart Ostro, Chair
11:15-11:25	Orientation to Chapter 6 and Related Appendices of the Analytical Plan	Mr. Jim DeMocker, EPA
11:25-11:40	Charge Questions for August 27-29 Meeting Questions from HES Members and Clarifications from Agency	HES Members Mr. Jim DeMocker
11:40-12:00	Discussion of Analytical Plan <i>Is it clear and adequate to address the charge questions? Are supplemental materials needed?</i>	Members
12:00-12:15	Draft Agenda for August 27-29 Meeting <i>Is it clear? Do changes need to be made?</i>	Panel Members
12:15-12:25	Roles and Responsibilities Before and at the August 27-29 Meeting	Panel Member
12:25-12:30	Summary of Next Steps	Dr. Bart Ostro
12:30	Adjourn	